

CITY OF SAN JOSÉ, CALIFORNIA  
 Department of Planning, Building and Code Enforcement  
 801 North First Street, Room 400  
 San José, California 95110-1795

Hearing Date/Agenda Number

H.L.C. 03/05/03

Item 4.a.

File Number

HP03-003

Application Type

Historic Preservation Permit

Council District

6

SNI

NA

Planning Area

Central

Assessor's Parcel Number(s)

274-24-026

## STAFF REPORT

### PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Completed by: Sally Notthoff Zarnowitz

Location: Northwesterly corner of Naglee Avenue and Dana Avenue (1600 Naglee Avenue)

Gross Acreage: 11

Net Acreage: 11

Net Density: n/a

Existing Zoning: R-1-8 Residential

Existing Use: Municipal Rose Garden, City Landmark No. HS95-102

Proposed Zoning: No change

Proposed Use: Municipal Rose Garden, City Landmark No. HS95-102

### GENERAL PLAN

Completed by: SNZ

Land Use/Transportation Diagram Designation

Public Park and Open Space

Project Conformance:

☒ Yes ☐ No☐ See Analysis and Recommendations

### SURROUNDING LAND USES AND ZONING

Completed by: SNZ

North: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

East: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

South: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

West: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

Completed by: SNZ

☐ Environmental Impact Report found complete☐ Negative Declaration circulated on☐ Negative Declaration adopted on☒ Exempt☐ Environmental Review Incomplete

### FILE HISTORY

Completed by: SNZ

Annexation Title: College Park/Burbank Sur

Date: 9/08/1925

### PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATIONS

☒ Recommend Approval☐ Recommend Approval with Conditions☐ Recommend Denial

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Approved by: \_\_\_\_\_

OWNER	DEVELOPER	ARCHITECT
Attn. Julie Mark, Deputy Director City of San Jose P.R.N.S. 1300 Senter Road San Jose CA 95112	Ron Cheung, Project Manager City of San Jose P.R.N.S. 2 No. 2 <sup>nd</sup> St., Suite 700 San Jose CA 95113	Gil Sanchez, F.A.I.A. 3012 Glen Canyon Rd. Santa Cruz CA 95066

---

PUBLIC AGENCY COMMENTS RECEIVED	Completed by: SNZ
Department of Public Works	
None	
Other Departments and Agencies	
None	
GENERAL CORRESPONDENCE	
None	
ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	

## **BACKGROUND**

The applicant, the City of San Jose Department of Parks, Recreation and Neighborhood Services is requesting a Historic Preservation permit in conjunction with a previous HP permit to allow for replacement paving for the central pathway in San Jose's eleven acre Municipal Rose Garden, Historic Landmark No. HS95-102. The previous permit (HP02-020) was approved in 2002, allowing the rehabilitation of the two circa 1938 masonry comfort stations, the construction of a new masonry maintenance structure and the installation of decomposed granite pathways for disabled access to the garden, new fencing and light fixtures.

The site is zoned R-1-8 Residential and is designated Public Park and Open Space on the adopted San Jose 2020 Land Use and Transportation Diagram. Surrounding land uses include single-family detached residential to the north across Emory Street, the south across Naglee Avenue, the east across Dana Avenue and the west across Garden Drive.

### ***Historic Resource Description***

This City Landmark appears to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, as per *Architectural Program and History of the Municipal Rose Garden Buildings*, dated August 5, 2002 by Gil Sanchez, FAIA, Architecture, Historic Preservation.

The Santa Clara County Rose Society provided the inspiration for the Rose Garden. The ground-breaking ceremony took place on April 7, 1931. Noted Landscape Architect John McLaren (Golden Gate Park) prepared the garden design. Dr. Horace McFarland of the American Rose Society and San Jose Planning Director Michael Antonacci were involved with the plan. The City Council of San Jose approved the plans on June 1, 1931. Subsequent addition of the remaining five and one-half acres soon doubled the size of the Rose Garden. Saturday, May 15, 1937 marked the official dedication of the San Jose Municipal Rose Garden.

The brick pillars were completed in 1937. The two masonry comfort station buildings were constructed from 1938 to 1939. The Native Daughters of the Golden West and the Native Sons of the Golden West planted the redwood groves in March of 1944. Funds for the two-tiered water fountain were donated in February of 1967. Miniature rose beds were installed and planted in April of 1973. The installation of an irrigation system was completed in May of 1974. In 1988, the Santa Clara County Rose Society constructed a 63-foot long wooden arbor at the Dana Avenue entrance to the Rose Garden that was funded by San Jose Beautiful.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

Under the provisions of Section 15331 of the State Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), this project is found to be exempt from environmental review in that the project is limited to the rehabilitation of a historical resource in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings (1995), Weeks and Grimmer as well as the The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for the Treatment of Cultural Landscapes (1996) Birnbaum.

## **GENERAL PLAN CONFORMANCE**

The proposed project is consistent with the site's General Plan Land Use/Transportation Diagram designation of Public Park and Open Space. Additionally, the rehabilitation is consistent with the General Plan Historic, Archaeological and Cultural Resources Goal of the preservation of historically significant structures and districts in order to promote a greater sense of awareness and community identity and to enhance the quality of urban living.

## **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The project proposes to replace the existing asphalt paving (as called out in the 1992 Master Plan) on the approximately twelve-foot wide, 500-foot long curved central pathway with a dyed, stamped and colored concrete slab edged with a double-row brick band.

The central pathway starts at the north entrance to the Rose Garden on Emory Street and continues along between the western edge of the stage and the eastern edge of the lawn to the south entrance to the Rose Garden on Naglee Avenue. The pathway provides maintenance vehicle (garbage and waste disposal vehicles) and disabled access across the site as well as around the fountain to the Dana Street entrance and to the public restrooms.

## **ANALYSIS**

The primary project issue is conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. (Standards) The project conforms to the Standards in general, and in particular to Standards No. 1 and No. 9.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The project proposes to maintain the historical use of the property as a garden park in conformance with Standard No. 1. The central pathway's location, scale and proportion respect the integrity of the Rose Garden's features and spatial relationships, although this pathway does not appear to be an original or historic component of the Garden.

The historic landscape design of the Garden utilized pervious surfaces. The existing non-historic asphalt paving material is not compatible with the natural materials of the garden setting. Planning staff has recommended that the Department of Parks and Recreation explore alternatives to their current proposal for replacement paving that more sensitively matches the natural historical landscape materials of earth and lawn in design, color and texture in conformance with Standard No. 9, if possible. The Department of Parks and Recreation staff will present at least one alternative pervious paving proposal that would be consistent with the historic materials and drainage design of the Garden at the Historic Landmarks Commission March 5, 2003 meeting for review.

### **COMMUNITY OUTREACH**

On June 17, 2002 the City of San Jose Department of Parks, Recreation and Neighborhood Services conducted a community meeting at Trace Elementary School to present the proposed rehabilitation of the Municipal Rose Garden. On August 15, 2002 a meeting was held to determine the community's preference for pathway paving options.

A public hearing notice for the project was published in a local newspaper and mailed to all property owners and tenants within 500 feet of the subject site.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission review and discuss the colors and materials presented at the Public Hearing in order to

1. Find that the materials are in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards
2. Recommend approval of the proposed replacement paving for the central pathway in the Municipal Rose Garden to the Director of Planning.

Attachments:

- ? DPR
- ? *Architectural Program and History of the Municipal Rose Garden Buildings*, by Gil Sanchez, FAIA, Architecture, Historic Preservation
- ? Location Map